

Survey Title: 2023 Compact Climate Assessment Tool Survey
Report Type: Individual Responses
Start Date: 27-Apr-23
End Date: 11-Sep-23
Sent: 19
Delivered: 19
Bounced: 0
Completed: 27
Unique Access Rate: 89.47%
Incomplete: 2
Incomplete Incl. in Report: 2

Response No: 19

Email ID: <u>Public Access</u>
Participation Time: <u>8/31/2023 16:45</u>
IP Address: 72.46.225.100

Q1. Local/Tribal Government
<i>Miami Beach</i>
Q2. County
Miami-Dade County
Q3. Key Staff Contact
Q3(a). Key Staff Contact: Name
<i>Amy Knowles</i>
Q3(b). Key Staff Contact: Title

Chief Resilience Officer/ Environment and Sustainability Director

Q3(c). Key Staff Contact: Email Address

AmyKnowles@miamibeachfl.gov

Q4. Describe the progress your local/tribal government has made related to Mitigation Action #1. Please select all that apply.

In the past several years we have advanced/completed work related to this priority action that is still relevant today.

We actively advanced activities related to this priority action in this reporting year (CY 2022).

Q5. Provide a brief description of the work you are advancing related to Mitigation Action #1. This is not meant to be an exhaustive list, but rather a list of the most impactful actions.

The Miami Beach Mayor and City Commission unanimously adopted Resolution No. 2021-31664 declaring climate change to be caused by "human activity" and pledging to achieve net-zero GHG emissions by 2050. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/2021-31664-Resolution.pdf>) The baseline inventory for the City of Miami Beach was compiled by the Environment & Sustainability (E&S) Department in 2014. An annual community-wide and government operations GHG inventory is compiled each year. The GHG inventory guides and supports the creation of emission reduction programs and policies. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/climate-mitigation/green-house-gases/>) The city is currently working on its first Climate Action Plan which will prioritize high impact actions to reduce GHG emissions and set GHG emissions reduction targets. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/your-city-at-work/resilience-strategy/climate-action-plan>) The Comprehensive Plan includes policy objective for reduction of carbon emissions. (<https://www.miamibeachfl.gov/wp-content/uploads/2022/12/2040-Comprehensive-Plan-9-14-2022-Adopted-Compressed.pdf>) The city is actively reviewing and strategizing for federal grant funding through the IRA and BIL, among other funding opportunities.

Q6. Is equity being embedded into Mitigation Action #1? Please indicate your progress toward embedding equity in this action with "1" indicating no progress and "5" indicating significant progress. Below are several suggested ways that a local/tribal government can embed equity into this climate action provided as supportive guidance. This is not meant to be exhaustive of every possible action. Respondents can include actions not included in this list. For more guidance, visit the full document on the Compact website. Ensure the inventory and/or goal setting document(s) is/are publicly available and is interpreted for commonly spoken languages in the municipality as well as screen-reader compatible Build partnerships with community-based organizations, HOAs, and community-based forums to help define, design, and advance the work as well as spread the word Ensure an equity first framework, so that GHG emission reductions do not come at the expense of low income and/or communities of color Use a Racial Equity Toolkit

to consider impacts before taking on any project Include stipends/payments for volunteers in your budget Make sure budgeted meeting costs include childcare, meals, and/or interpretation services Utilize multiple engagement methods, e.g. online and in-person. Utilize existing relationships with other municipal departments Acknowledge that elderly and low-income populations are less likely to engage with online promotion. Utilize in-person outreach (flyers, canvassing, announcement at an existing meeting, radio stations, TV, flyers at churches or community center, etc.) for these groups

2

Q7. Please provide a brief explanation of the ways in which you are embedding equity into Mitigation Action #1.

*The City has created a public website with open data and information about all of its resilience and climate adaptation and mitigation programs and policies.
(<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/climate-mitigation/green-house-gases/>)*

Q8. Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #1. Max upload of five (5) files only.

Q8(a). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #1. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

2021-31664-Resolution.pdf

Q8(b). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #1. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

2040-Comprehensive-Plan-9-14-2022-Compressed.pdf

Q8(c). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #1. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q8(d). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #1. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q8(e). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #1. Max upload of five

(5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q9. Please indicate as to why you've been unable to advance activities related to Mitigation Action #1? Please select all that apply.

Skipped due to logic

Q10. What resources could assist you in advancing this action?

Skipped due to logic

Q11. Describe the progress your local/tribal government has made related to Mitigation Action #2. Please select all that apply.

In the past several years we have advanced/completed work related to this priority action that is still relevant today.

We actively advanced activities related to this priority action in this reporting year (CY 2022).

Q12. Provide a brief description of the work you are advancing related to Mitigation Action #2. This is not meant to be an exhaustive list, but rather a list of the most impactful actions.

The city's Green Building Ordinance requires new construction over 7,000 square feet to receive LEED Gold certification or Living Building Challenge certification. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/climate-adaptation/green-infrastructure/green-building-ordinance/>) The city utilizes the electric utility bill management system, EnergyCAP, to track electricity consumption in all municipal buildings, analyze trends, and identify opportunities for energy efficiency projects. The city is currently working on its first Climate Action Plan which will prioritize high impact actions to reduce GHG emissions and set GHG emissions reduction targets. A focus area for the CAP is energy consumption in buildings. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/your-city-at-work/resilience-strategy/climate-action-plan/>) The city provides links for resources for energy efficiency and energy conservation, such EnergyStar Portfolio Manager, a free and publicly available online tool, for assessing energy efficiency of buildings. The city also encourages participation in the county's BE305 program. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/your-home/energy-conservation/>) The City of Miami Beach is completing an energy assessment of its municipal buildings. A consultant is performing an energy audit of the city's energy consumption and expenditures and looking at equipment operating conditions to identify cost-effective energy solutions. The consultant will utilize this analysis to prioritize the highest impact projects and will produce a report of the top 5 energy efficiency projects/strategies. The city conducts virtual and in-person community outreach related to energy efficiency and energy conservation. For example, the city has provided a grant to Dream In Green to provide WE-Lab workshops for the community.

Q13. Is equity being embedded into Mitigation Action #2? Please indicate your progress toward embedding equity in this action with “1” indicating no progress and “5” indicating significant progress. Below are several suggested ways that a local/tribal government can embed equity into this climate action provided as supportive guidance. This is not meant to be exhaustive of every possible action. Respondents can include actions not included in this list. For more guidance, visit the full document on the Compact website. Engage communities most impacted by energy inefficiency in planning and prioritizing community projects/action Develop partnerships with community members or organizations to help track energy efficiency data and prioritize improvements Involve the people most impacted by energy inefficiency, build relationships, and co-create path forward Commit municipal savings from solar and energy efficiency being reinvested in wealth-building initiatives in disinvested communities Ensure policies/permits for energy saving installations (green roofs, rooftop solar, storm hardening) are feasible, and if possible expedited and fee-free Allocate funds annually to pay for outreach campaigns to ensure all communities are aware of energy efficiency programs and assistance Work with local community-based organizations to be an education partner on energy efficiency behaviors and techniques/installations

2

Q14. Please provide a brief explanation of the ways in which you are embedding equity into Mitigation Action #2.

Public hearing fees are waived for the installation of sustainable roofing systems which includes green roofs, blue roofs, cool roofs, and rooftop solar and certain permit fees are waived for renewable energy/solar systems and EV charging stations installations. The City works with local non-profit organization (Dream in Green) to provide community workshops (WE-LAB) on energy and water efficiency and give take-home kits to implement strategies at home. The city has amended its Green Building Ordinance to provide exemptions for workforce and affordable housing.

Q15. Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #2. Max upload of five (5) files only.

Q15(a). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #2. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

2016-3993-Ordinance.pdf

Q15(b). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #2. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

Ordinance 2022-4513.pdf

Q15(c). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #2. Max upload of five

(5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q15(d). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #2. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q15(e). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #2. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q16. Please indicate as to why you've been unable to advance activities related to Mitigation Action #2? Please select all that apply.

Skipped due to logic

Q17. What resources could assist you in advancing this action?

Skipped due to logic

Q18. Describe the progress your local/tribal government has made related to Mitigation Action #3. Please select all that apply.

In the past several years we have advanced/completed work related to this priority action that is still relevant today.

We actively advanced activities related to this priority action in this reporting year (CY 2022).

Q19. Provide a brief description of the work you are advancing related to Mitigation Action #3. This is not meant to be an exhaustive list, but rather a list of the most impactful actions.

Through the SolSmart program, an advisor reviewed the City of Miami Beach Code to identify barriers. Following their recommendations, several updates were made including residential height exception for solar, and accessory use for PV in all districts. The city achieved SolSmart Gold designation. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/LTC-260-2019.pdf>) The City has partnered with non-profit organization Solar United Neighbors to develop and implement a solar co-op program along with Miami-Dade County and other community partners. Solar United

Neighbors (SUN) has presented on solar co-op to the resident Sustainability Committee among other community workshops. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/climate-mitigation/renewable-energy/solar-co-op/>) Conduct virtual community outreach related to solar energy and solar co-ops. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/your-home/sustainachella/>) For some city projects, conditions for solar are assessed to determine feasibility and cost. Staff is currently analyzing the feasibility of installing solar arrays on the Fleet facility. The Facilities and Fleet Management Department has a few municipal buildings that are currently appropriate for solar installations based on roof age and quality and one of the buildings submitted a budget request for solar rooftop installation.

Q20. Is equity being embedded into Mitigation Action #3? Please indicate your progress toward embedding equity in this action with “1” indicating no progress and “5” indicating significant progress. Below are several suggested ways that a local/tribal government can embed equity into this climate action provided as supportive guidance. This is not meant to be exhaustive of every possible action. Respondents can include actions not included in this list. For more guidance, visit the full document on the Compact website. The municipality should model best practices regarding solar energy i.e. identifying which parks, public places, or schools currently utilize or plan to utilize solar energy. Record the savings before and after installation Include community leaders and members in program design Consider ways renters can reap benefits of solar, e.g. community solar projects Solar permitting should be expedited and fee-free Devote money/personnel to support and promote solar co-ops Provide education on lower cost ways for residents to go solar, such as SolarTogether and existing solar co-ops

2

Q21. Please provide a brief explanation of the ways in which you are embedding equity into Mitigation Action #3.

The solar related building permit fees are waived. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/2017-4130-Ordinance.pdf>) The Land Development and Permitting fees are waived for renewable energy systems. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/2017-4130-Ordinance.pdf>) Ordinance which creates height exceptions to allow for solar panels. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/2017-4124-Ordinance.pdf>) The City of Miami Beach has achieved the SolSmart Gold designation, for its efforts to reduce barriers to solar for the community and streamlined its solar permit process. An advisor from SolSmart reviewed the City's code to identify any barriers to solar and provided recommendations. The City implemented those recommendations to reach Gold designation. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/LTC-260-2019.pdf>) The City has partnered with non-profit organization on solar co-op program and collaborated with organizations including local branch of NAACP for community outreach. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/climate-mitigation/renewable-energy/solar-co-op/>)

Q22. Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #3. Max upload of five (5) files only.

Q22(a). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #3. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

2017-4124-Ordinance.pdf

Q22(b). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #3. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

2017-4130-Ordinance.pdf

Q22(c). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #3. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q22(d). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #3. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q22(e). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #3. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q23. Please indicate as to why you've been unable to advance activities related to Mitigation Action #3? Please select all that apply.

Skipped due to logic

Q24. What resources could assist you in advancing this action?

Skipped due to logic

Q25. Describe the progress your local/tribal government has made related to Mitigation Action #4. Please select all that apply.

In the past several years we have advanced/completed work related to this priority action that is still relevant today.

We actively advanced activities related to this priority action in this reporting year (CY 2022).

Q26. Provide a brief description of the work you are advancing related to Mitigation Action #4. This is not meant to be an exhaustive list, but rather a list of the most impactful actions.

A new agreement with Blink was recently approved for installation and maintenance of EV chargers. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/climate-mitigation/electric-vehicles/>) There are currently chargers at the following locations: 1900 Bay Road (2) 1301 Collins - 13 th Street Garage (2) 4166 Royal Palm Ave - 42 nd Street Garage (2) 512 12 th Street - 12 th Street & Drexel Avenue Garage (2) 1755 Meridian Avenue - City Hall garage (2) 640 17 th Street - 17 th Street Garage (2) 1701 Convention Center Drive - Convention Center Loading Dock (2) 1701 Convention Center Drive - Convention Center Parking Deck 4 th Fl. (14) 1701 Convention Center Drive - Convention Center Parking Deck 5 th Fl. (14) 340 23 rd Street - Collins Park Garage (5) The city has entered into an agreement with Florida Power & Light (FPL) for the installation of level 3 fast-charging stations citywide. The agreement will have an initial term of 10 years. The proposed locations are the parking lots located at: 401 Alton Rd, 1493 Michigan Ave, and 2660 Collins Ave. <https://docmgmt.miamibeachfl.gov/WebLink/PDF/dd2060ed-2377-4533-ab26-60ad8f445ba6/Resolution%202023-32696.pdf> Educational materials available on our website including a map of available EV charging stations in the city. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/climate-mitigation/electric-vehicles/>) EV Ready Ordinance establishes minimum requirements for electric vehicle parking spaces and charging stations. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/2018/07/2016-3988-Ordinance.pdf>) The city is considering updates to the current standards. The Miami Beach Smartway Parking Permit program allows residents to obtain a residential parking decal at a 50% discount. (<https://www.miamibeachfl.gov/city-hall/parking/permit-programs/hybrid-vehicle-parking/>)

Q27. Is equity being embedded into Mitigation Action #4? Please indicate your progress toward embedding equity in this action with “1” indicating no progress and “5” indicating significant progress. Below are several suggested ways that a local/tribal government can embed equity into this climate action provided as supportive guidance. This is not meant to be exhaustive of every possible action. Respondents can include actions not included in this list. For more guidance, visit the full document on the Compact website. Involve the community in evaluation of this action’s progress Evaluate how low-income and/or communities of color access mobility and their relative air pollution exposure burden, and utilize this information to inform any EV strategy for the municipality Offer technical assistance to community groups working to advance this goal Offer streamlined permitting, lower to no fees, and other incentives for EV charging projects Analyze fuel and maintenance savings from EV switch and use the savings to create a charger fund Meetings/workshops for education/outreach should take place at a variety of times, including evenings, offer food and childcare to reduce barriers to attendance and participation. The meetings should be advertised by a community-based communications and outreach consultant/partner who is from the targeted community(ies). The advertising efforts should include a variety of mediums and start at least a week prior to the meeting. The communications/outreach consultant should reach at least 300 people in advertising for the meeting

2

Q28. Please provide a brief explanation of the ways in which you are embedding equity into Mitigation Action #4.

The permitting fees from the Building, Planning and Fire Departments for EV charging stations installed on private property were temporarily waived, until March 31, 2023.
(<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/2021-4404-Ordinance.pdf>)

Q29. Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #4. Max upload of five (5) files only.

Q29(a). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #4. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

2016-3988-Ordinance.pdf

Q29(b). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #4. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

Resolution 2023-32696.pdf

Q29(c). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #4. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q29(d). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #4. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q29(e). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #4. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q30. Please indicate as to why you've been unable to advance activities related to Mitigation Action #4? Please select all that apply.

Skipped due to logic

Q31. What resources could assist you in advancing this action?

Skipped due to logic

Q32. Describe the progress your local/tribal government has made related to Mitigation Action #5. Please select all that apply.

In the past several years we have advanced/completed work related to this priority action that is still relevant today.

We actively advanced activities related to this priority action in this reporting year (CY 2022).

Q33. Provide a brief description of the work you are advancing related to Mitigation Action #5. This is not meant to be an exhaustive list, but rather a list of the most impactful actions.

Completed neighborhood specific studies. (<https://www.miamibeachfl.gov/city-hall/transportation/plans-studies/>) The Transportation, Parking, and Bicycle-Pedestrian Facilities Committee, composed of 14 community members, serves in an advisory capacity in matters of transportation and parking as they relate to the unique neighborhoods of the city. (<https://www.miamibeachfl.gov/city-hall/parking/transportation-parking-and-bicycle-pedestrian-facilities-committee/>) The citywide trolley service provides free service 15 hours per day, 7 days per week along 4 routes throughout the city. (<https://www.miamibeachfl.gov/city-hall/transportation/trolley/>) There have been seven projects completed totaling 31,000 linear feet for bike lanes on both sides of the road in several neighborhoods. Long-term bicycle parking and bike repair stations are available for free in 6 of the municipal garages and additional repair stations are available for free across the city. (<https://www.miamibeachfl.gov/city-hall/transportation/bicycle-and-pedestrians/>) The City has set alternative parking requirements and reducing minimum off-street parking requirements to encourage alternative modes of transportation. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/2017-4138-Ordinance.pdf>) The City adopted mode share that puts pedestrians first, transit/bicycles/freight second, and private vehicles third (corridor based). (<https://www.miamibeachfl.gov/city-hall/transportation/bicycle-and-pedestrians/>) The Miami Beach Mayor and City Commission adopted Resolution No. 2017-30112 setting goals for all city trolleys and buses to be zero-emission and powered by clean energy. (<https://docmgmt.miamibeachfl.gov/WebLink/DocView.aspx?id=215079&dbid=0&repo=CityClerk>) GO Bond funding allocated for projects related to Mitigation Action #5 including sidewalk improvements, street corridor improvements, bike lanes and shared paths. (<https://www.gombinfo.com/>)

Q34. Is equity being embedded into Mitigation Action #5? Please indicate your progress toward embedding equity in this action with “1” indicating no progress and “5” indicating significant progress. Below are several suggested ways that a local/tribal government can embed equity into this climate action provided as supportive guidance. This is not meant to be exhaustive of every possible action. Respondents can include actions not included in this list. For more guidance, visit the full document on the Compact website. Meaningfully include community members who rely on public transit as a primary form of transportation at the decision-making table when it comes to accessing mobility needs and planning future changes/improvements To encourage adoption of working from home to reduce overall VMT, partner with telecommunications company to

ensure there is access throughout the municipality to high-speed internet and that communities are not left behind in the digital divide Develop codes or policies encouraging the use of pedestrian-friendly planning options like complete streets and parks no less than 'x' miles from every home Ensure annual budget allocation to maintain sidewalks and build them where they don't exist to connect low-income communities or communities of color to transit stops Host listening sessions, focus groups, and workshops to understand what is and isn't working. Prioritize riders but also those that are unable to use public transit to understand obstacles to ridership Build programs around these solutions and include transit workers in these discussions

4

Q35. Please provide a brief explanation of the ways in which you are embedding equity into Mitigation Action #5.

The City offers 2 free on-demand transit services to the public: on-demand transit service for seniors and Mid-Beach on-demand transit service. (<https://www.miamibeachfl.gov/city-hall/transportation/on-demand-transit-service/>) Interactive map of long-term bicycle parking and repair stations is available online. (<https://www.miamibeachfl.gov/city-hall/transportation/bicycle-and-pedestrians/>)

Q36. Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #5. Max upload of five (5) PDFs only.

Q36(a). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #5. Max upload of five (5) PDFs only.:

2017-30112 Resolution_p1.pdf

Q36(b). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #5. Max upload of five (5) PDFs only.:

2017-4138-Ordinance.pdf

Q36(c). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #5. Max upload of five (5) PDFs only.:

(Did not answer)

Q36(d). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #5. Max upload of five (5) PDFs only.:

(Did not answer)

Q36(e). Please provide any supporting documents under Mitigation Action #5. Max upload of five (5) PDFs only.:

(Did not answer)

Q37. Please indicate as to why you've been unable to advance activities related to Mitigation Action #5? Please select all that apply.

Skipped due to logic

Q38. What resources could assist you in advancing this action?

Skipped due to logic

Q39. Describe the progress your local/tribal government has made related to Adaptation Action #1. Please select all that apply. This should include identifying potential staff and financial resources/capacity. In some cases, staff/resources may already be supporting activities and projects that help support and advance adaptation/resilience, but not identified as such. Should sufficient internal capacity not exist, seek support from your county, other municipalities, and other potential partners and develop a plan for how your city will prioritize capacity for adaptation/resilience-building work.

In the past several years we have advanced/completed work related to this priority action that is still relevant today.

We actively advanced activities related to this priority action in this reporting year (CY 2022).

Q40. Provide a brief description of the work you are advancing related to Adaptation Action #1. This is not meant to be an exhaustive list, but rather a list of the most impactful actions.

The City has a resilience team headed by the Chief Resilience Officer and has recently added a new position for Resilience Coordinator. The resilience team now has 3 people and this new position is solely dedicated to resilience work. The Resilience team works with departments across to City to advance initiatives that improve resilience and expand adaptation to climate change. The City has staffing capacity to advance planning, public infrastructure and private property adaptation, emergency management initiatives. The City opened Brittany Bay, an example of hybrid living shoreline with mangroves and bioswale, significant capacity building for city staff with the Nature Conservancy. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/climate-adaptation/green-infrastructure/living-shorelines/>) The City broke ground for Maurice Gibb park, with elevation, hybrid living shoreline, and mangrove expansion as part of the redesign.

(<https://www.miamibeachfl.gov/residents/neighborhood-affairs-division/active-projects/parks/maurice-gibb-park/>)

Q41. Is equity being embedded into Adaptation Action #1? Please indicate your progress toward embedding equity in this action with “1” indicating no progress and “5” indicating significant progress. Below are several suggested ways that a local/tribal government can embed equity into this climate action provided as supportive guidance. This is not meant to be exhaustive of every possible action. Respondents can include actions not included in this list. Assess the capacity to include equity considerations, including community engagement & outreach Assessment includes consideration of how well prepared the community is to advance adaptation initiatives in more vulnerable/disinvested communities Assess agency understanding of inequity and historic environmental wrongs in the community (and how inequities may be exacerbated by government practices/policies). Provide training for staff, emphasizing the importance of correcting these issues and avoiding further harms in the future Assess areas of the municipality that have been disinvested or are low-income Staff has worked to build and maintain relationships and trust with community-based organizations, key thought leaders, and residents in the areas of the municipality which have been disinvested Assess and collaborate with Departments that provide/direct social services to residents or that work on equity as adaptation partners

2

Q42. Please provide a brief explanation of the ways in which you are embedding equity into this adaptation action?

Staff has participated in several community outreach events and interviews to guide their work including with the Private Property Adaptation Program and Sea Level Rise Vulnerability Assessment and Adaptation Plan.

Q43. Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #1. Max upload of five (5) files only.

Q43(a). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #1. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q43(b). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #1. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q43(c). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #1. Max

upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q43(d). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #1. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q43(e). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #1. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q44. Please indicate as to why you've been unable to make progress in Adaptation Action #1? Select all that apply.

Skipped due to logic

Q45. What resources could assist you in advancing this action?

Skipped due to logic

Q46. Describe the progress your local/tribal government has made related to Adaptation Action #2. Please select all that apply. Conduct vulnerability analysis of hazards related to climate change including, but not limited to, sea level rise, tidal flooding, saltwater intrusion, extreme weather, heat. The analysis should assess exposure and sensitivity of various assets including, but not limited to critical infrastructure, communities/populations, historic/cultural assets, transportation, natural resources, and economic assets. Assessment should seek to identify what factors contribute to elevated exposure and sensitivity, and what physical, social, institutional, human, and financial capacities exist to adapt, and where there are gaps.

In the past several years we have advanced/completed work related to this priority action that is still relevant today.

We actively advanced activities related to this priority action in this reporting year (CY 2022).

Q47. Provide a brief description of the work you are advancing related to Adaptation Action #2. This is not meant to be an exhaustive list, but rather a list of the most impactful actions.

The City is developing a Sea Level Rise Vulnerability Assessment and Adaptation Plan funded by the State Resilient Florida grant program. Through this initiative, the city will provide the community with opportunities to share their experiences with flood risk in their neighborhoods, how this risk affects them, and how the city can approach flood mitigation and sea level rise adaptation to best serve the community's needs. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/your-city-at-work/resilience-strategy/sea-level-rise-vulnerability-assessment/>)

Q48. Is equity being embedded into Adaptation Action #2? Please indicate your progress toward embedding equity in this action with “1” indicating no progress and “5” indicating significant progress. Below are several suggested ways that a local/tribal government can embed equity into this climate action provided as supportive guidance. This is not meant to be exhaustive of every possible action. Respondents can include actions not included in this list. Consider all properties, people, and communities equally in the Vulnerability Analysis or Assessment. The methodology should not prioritize or focus on areas with higher taxable value. If study scope includes proposing adaptation strategies, those strategies considered should be prioritized based on potential to reduce risk to human life and other key indicators based on community members’ experiences. Include opportunities for meaningful community input as part of the vulnerability analysis process. Use community feedback and information based on stakeholder experiences in the data analysis. Incorporate community feedback via asset-mapping exercises, seek assistance with prioritizing/ weighing criteria for the vulnerability assessment, ground-truth the findings of the analysis, etc. Include a social vulnerability assessment as part of the overall vulnerability assessment. At minimum, Federal SOVI or SVI maps can be used, but ideally the assessment should be rooted in the community itself. Depending on the type of project, the following social factors may be relevant to include in your analysis: redlining, low–and moderate-income populations, energy burden, rent/cost of living burden, language spoken at home, vehicles per household, elderly residents, average year built of housing, and tree canopy, among others. Include an assessment of organizations in the community that may help advance the municipality’s adaptive capacity, or organizations which will help communicate with populations frequently unengaged by government.

4

Q49. Please provide a brief explanation of the ways in which you are embedding equity into this adaptation action?

Studies and assessments conducted by the City consider all types properties, people, and communities. Residents of Miami Beach were invited to provide input on the Vulnerability Assessment through six small focus groups in June of 2023. During these one-hour long group interviews, participants joined online calls with the City’s consultants and 4 other interviewees from their district - South, Mid-, or North Beach - to share their experiences with flooding and how they were impacted by those experiences. Additionally, they were asked for input on the community facilities and infrastructure that residents and business owners believe should be focused on for flood protection.

Q50. Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #2. Max upload of five (5) files only.

Q50(a). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #2. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q50(b). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #2. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q50(c). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #2. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q50(d). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #2. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q50(e). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #2. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q51. Please indicate as to why you've been unable to make progress in Adaptation Action #2? Select all that apply.

Skipped due to logic

Q52. What resources could assist you in advancing this action?

Skipped due to logic

Q53. Describe the progress your local/tribal government has made related to Adaptation Action #3. Please select all that apply.

In the past several years we have advanced/completed work related to this priority action that is still relevant today.

We actively advanced activities related to this priority action in this reporting year (CY 2022).

Q54. Provide a brief description of the work you are advancing related to Adaptation Action #3. This is not meant to be an exhaustive list, but rather a list of the most impactful actions.

The City has a dedicated resiliency team headed by the City's Chief Resilience Officer. The City of Miami Beach collaborated with Miami-Dade County and the City of Miami on a joint resilience strategy: Resilient305. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/your-city-at-work/resilience-strategy/resilient-305/>) The Miami Beach Strategic Plan was updated in 2019 through the lens of resilience. The strategic plan addresses the city's needs in both the near-term and long-term and incorporates actions to reduce shocks and stresses. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/your-city-at-work/resilience-strategy/strategic-plan-2/>) The plan is being updated for submission with the FY 24 Operating Budget. The City has 17 projects underway to implement the Public Seawall Action Plan, the new Stormwater Master Plan Update in underway and due to be completed this fall. There are three neighborhood adaptation projects underway with larger stormwater systems, sewer, road elevation, street redesign to incorporate green infrastructure and the Urban Forestry Master Plan. City is getting ready to break ground on West Avenue, is at 60% design for First Street, and has awarded design contract for North Beach

Q55. Is equity being embedded into Adaptation Action #3? Please indicate your progress toward embedding equity in this action with “1” indicating no progress and “5” indicating significant progress. Below are several suggested ways that a local/tribal government can embed equity into this climate action provided as supportive guidance. This is not meant to be exhaustive of every possible action. Respondents can include actions not included in this list. Provide multiple benefits or co-benefits in disinvested communities based upon community input Prioritize the solutions/resources in the Plan by their potential to reduce risk rather than by geography, property values, or income Engage and collaborate with the community as part of the development of the Plan Ensure at least 50% of the solutions come directly from community members and/or organizations that represent community members from disinvested communities Use an Equity Toolkit to identify and correct any unintended impacts (and potential benefits) of actions within that Plan on low-income disinvested communities, or communities of color. Ensure the toolkit for each action is made public for accountability and discussion Develop metrics and milestones that are reported on publicly so the municipality can be held accountable. Set expectations with the community on the format and frequency of reporting Ensure solutions sufficiently address all climate threats. Take into consideration how climate threats affect individuals and neighborhoods differently (based on various factors including social determinants of health) Include a mix of solutions including a mix of policy and capital projects. Capital projects should include a plan and budget for upkeep and maintenance Include strategies that protect the lives and health of outdoor workers

3

Q56. Please provide a brief explanation of the ways in which you are embedding equity into this adaptation action?

In 2022, the City of Miami Beach launched the Fight The Flood Private Property Adaptation (PPA)

Program, a competitive grant for residential and commercial property owners in Miami Beach. Selected applicants may qualify to receive up to \$20,000 in funding to go towards a property risk assessment, in addition to the design and construction of resilient flood mitigation improvements. The grant is "match" based: the City will reimburse 50% of total program costs up to \$20,000. For low-to-moderate income (LMI) properties, 100% of program costs will be covered up to \$20,000. <https://www.mbrisingabove.com/your-home/private-property-adaptation/> The Jacobs Neighborhood Project Prioritization plan is prioritized by density and other categories, instead of just infrastructure need. The Project Evaluation Framework was publicly vetted and then applied to individual capital improvement projects. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/Neighborhood-Project-Prioritization-1.pdf>) Thousands of stakeholders that reflect a wide range of expertise, ages, ethnicities, cultures, income levels and geographic areas were engaged to help shape the Resilient305 Strategy. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/Our-Story.pdf>) As part of the Resilient305, there are recommended actions in the "People" goal area that aim to improve the lives of residents by supporting job and wealth creation; addressing specific health needs for the most vulnerable among us; and preparing and empowering neighborhoods and networks to anticipate and respond to disruptions, both large and small. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/Goal-2-People.pdf>)

Q57. Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #3. Max upload of five (5) files only.

Q57(a). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #3. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

Jacobs Report_Summary.pdf

Q57(b). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #3. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q57(c). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #3. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q57(d). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #3. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q57(e). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #3. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q58. Please indicate as to why you've been unable to make progress in Adaptation Action #3? Select all that apply.

Skipped due to logic

Q59. What resources could assist you in advancing this action?

Skipped due to logic

Q60. Describe the progress your local/tribal government has made related to Adaptation Action #4. Please select all that apply. This may include comprehensive plans, housing initiatives, post-disaster redevelopment plans, stormwater management plans, transportation plans, and land development regulations, inclusive of low-impact development. Sea Level Rise projections should be included in all planning activities.

In the past several years we have advanced/completed work related to this priority action that is still relevant today.

We actively advanced activities related to this priority action in this reporting year (CY 2022).

Q61. Provide a brief description of the work you are advancing related to Adaptation Action #4. This is not meant to be an exhaustive list, but rather a list of the most impactful actions.

The city has adopted a new Resiliency Code which is a comprehensive and flexible document that will address known impacts and provide necessary tools to manage circumstances that may impact the viability and economic security of the City. (<https://www.miamibeachfl.gov/city-hall/planning/resiliency-code/>) 'The Miami Beach Comprehensive Plan includes a Resiliency and Sustainability Element which consolidates the principles of sustainability and resiliency that were previously located in studies and other planning efforts commissioned by the City. The Housing Element (HE) of the Comprehensive Plan serves as a guide to provide equitable housing options to support the City's socio-economically diverse population and ensures that all residents of the City have access to quality, energy efficient housing. (<https://www.miamibeachfl.gov/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/2040-Comprehensive-Plan-10-16-2019-Adopted-13MB.pdf>) Sea level rise is included in all planning activities. (<https://docmgmt.miamibeachfl.gov/WebLink/DocView.aspx?id=143673&dbid=0&repo=CityClerk>) The Resilience Accelerator project with Columbia University focused on working through an integrated planning process to address flooding in the neighborhood. (https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/Resiliency-Accelerator-Final_9.4.18-1.pdf

Q62. Is equity being embedded into Adaptation Action #4? Please indicate your progress toward embedding equity in this action with "1" indicating no progress and "5" indicating significant

progress. Below are several suggested ways that a local/tribal government can embed equity into this climate action provided as supportive guidance. This is not meant to be exhaustive of every possible action. Respondents can include actions not included in this list. Engage and collaborate with the community as part of the development of the Plan. Ensure at least 50% of the solutions come directly from community members and/or organizations that represent community members from disinvested communities. Design and write the Plan to protect all communities equally and encourage risk reduction in areas most vulnerable to the impacts of climate change. The Plan also takes into account unintended consequences—such as gentrification—and provides solutions to mitigate/diminish negative impacts posed by solutions. Include an equity statement and explicitly state how equity was included in the development of the Plan and how equity was integrated into the recommendations. For redevelopment-specific actions or plans, ensure they are designed to improve conditions and resilience for burdened or disinvested communities rather than restore them to their current condition. Use an Equity Toolkit to identify and correct any unintended impacts (and potential benefits) of any Plan, policy, or budget decision on low-income disinvested communities, or communities of color. Ensure the toolkit for each policy/plan/budget decision is made public for accountability and discussion. List the affirmative steps made to incorporate and to include community input. Proactively consider equitable relocation strategies wherever it may be necessary. Include ways to minimize/eliminate displacement and incorporate equitable outcomes for existing communities in all relevant Plans.

3

Q63. Please provide a brief explanation of the ways in which you are embedding equity into this adaptation action?

In 2022, the City of Miami Beach launched the Fight The Flood Private Property Adaptation (PPA) Program, a competitive grant for residential and commercial property owners in Miami Beach. Selected applicants may qualify to receive up to \$20,000 in funding to go towards a property risk assessment, in addition to the design and construction of resilient flood mitigation improvements. The grant is “match” based: the City will reimburse 50% of total program costs up to \$20,000. For low-to-moderate income (LMI) properties, 100% of program costs will be covered up to \$20,000. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/your-home/private-property-adaptation/>) The City is developing a Sea Level Rise Vulnerability Assessment and Adaptation Plan funded by the State Resilient Florida grant program. Through this initiative, the city will provide the community with opportunities to share their experiences with flood risk in their neighborhoods, how this risk affects them, and how the city can approach flood mitigation and sea level rise adaptation to best serve the community’s needs. This process involves extensive community engagement in order to have community input and priorities in the selection of adaptation strategies. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/your-city-at-work/resilience-strategy/sea-level-rise-vulnerability-assessment/>)

Q64. Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #4. Max upload of five (5) files only.

Q64(a). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #4. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

Resiliency-Accelerator-Final_9.4.18-1.pdf

Q64(b). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #4. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

2040-Comprehensive-Plan-HE.pdf

Q64(c). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #4. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q64(d). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #4. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q64(e). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #4. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q65. Please indicate as to why you've been unable to make progress in Adaptation Action #4? Select all that apply.

Skipped due to logic

Q66. What resources could assist you in advancing this action?

Skipped due to logic

Q67. Describe the progress your local/tribal government has made related to Adaptation Action #5. Please select all that apply. This may include improving stormwater management practices, adopting urban heat policies, updating infrastructure standards, conducting remediation of contaminated sites, and updating building codes.

In the past several years we have advanced/completed work related to this priority action that is still relevant today.

We actively advanced activities related to this priority action in this reporting year (CY 2022).

Q68. Provide a brief description of the work you are advancing related to Adaptation Action #5. This is not meant to be an exhaustive list, but rather a list of the most impactful actions.

The Base Flood Elevation (BFE) was established at 8.0 ft. NGVD (6.44 ft. NAVD) throughout the City. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/2016-4010-Ordinance.pdf>) The Freeboard Ordinance establishes a minimum and maximum freeboard above base flood elevation for all properties. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/2016-4009-Ordinance.pdf>) The Miami Beach Comprehensive Plan was amended to comply with the Florida Legislature "Peril of Flood" requirements to reduce flood risks in coastal areas. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/2016-4027-Ordinance.pdf>) It is required that an increase of seawall caps on all new private construction and all public seawall construction be increased from 3.2 feet NAVD to 5.7 feet NAVD throughout the City. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/160608-seawall-elevation-5.7-Reso-2016-29454.pdf>) The city has established a sea level rise and resiliency review criteria as part of the review by the planning board. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/11/2017-4123-Ordinance.pdf>)

Q69. Is equity being embedded into Adaptation Action #5? Please indicate your progress toward embedding equity in this action with “1” indicating no progress and “5” indicating significant progress. Below are several suggested ways that a local/tribal government can embed equity into this climate action provided as supportive guidance. This is not meant to be exhaustive of every possible action. Respondents can include actions not included in this list. Engage and collaborate with the community as part of the development of the Plan Ensure at least 50% of the solutions come directly from community members and/or organizations that represent community members from disinvested communities Ensure policy is written to protect all communities equally and that it encourages risk reduction in areas most vulnerable to the impacts of climate change. The policy should also take into account unintended consequences-such as gentrification-and provide solutions to mitigate/diminish negative impacts posed by solutions Policies are written to improve the resilience of disinvested communities Policies are written to ensure equal access to new or proposed technology (e.g. public EV charging locations) Policies are written to improve conditions for disinvested communities through stronger remediation requirements or stormwater considerations Ensure contamination is not a barrier to adaptation. Remediate past harms while working to adapt to future threats, and take those future threats (like flooding) into consideration when selecting clean-up alternatives. Apply for EPA Brownfields grants if funding is the major obstacle Use an Equity Toolkit to identify and correct any unintended impacts (and potential benefits) of any policy on low-income disinvested communities or communities of color. Ensure the toolkit for each policy decision is made public for accountability and discussion

2

Q70. Please provide a brief explanation of the ways in which you are embedding equity into this adaptation action?

The standards set forth in the city's policies are implemented to ensure that the whole city is planning and building to meet resilience standards based on estimated future conditions. These policies are written to protect all communities equally; standards are implemented and enforced uniformly to ensure risk reduction for all.

Q71. Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #5. Max upload of five (5) files only.

Q71(a). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #5. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

2017-4123-Ordinance.pdf

Q71(b). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #5. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

160608-seawall-elevation-5.7-Reso-2016-29454.pdf

Q71(c). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #5. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

2016-4009-Ordinance.pdf

Q71(d). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #5. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

2016-4010-Ordinance.pdf

Q71(e). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #5. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q72. Please indicate as to why you've been unable to make progress in Adaptation Action #5? Select all that apply.

Skipped due to logic

Q73. What resources could assist you in advancing this action?

Skipped due to logic

Q74. Describe the progress your local/tribal government has made related to Adaptation Action #6. Please select all that apply. This may include living shorelines, water infrastructure, resilience hubs, parks & open spaces, urban greening, tidal valves, pump stations, road/bridge elevation.

In the past several years we have advanced/completed work related to this priority action that is still relevant today.

We actively advanced activities related to this priority action in this reporting year (CY 2022).

Q75. Provide a brief description of the work you are advancing related to Adaptation Action #6. This is not meant to be an exhaustive list, but rather a list of the most impactful actions.

The city's Neighborhood Improvement Projects include upgrading and making streets and various utilities' compliant with current codes, as well as risk reduction and adaptation to sea level rise. Stormwater pump stations have been updated, water treatment/pollutant capture elements included in the pump station systems, and tidal control valves installed.

(<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/your-city-at-work/stormwater-program/stormwater-pumps/>)

Roads in the most vulnerable areas of the city are being built at higher elevation.

(<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/your-city-at-work/stormwater-program/elevation/>) Living shorelines and hybrid shorelines have been successfully implemented.

(<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/climate-adaptation/green-infrastructure/living-shorelines/>) GO Bond funding allocated for projects related to Adaptation Action #6 including parks and open spaces. and urban forestry tree plantings. (<https://www.gombinfo.com/report/>)

Q76. Is equity being embedded into Adaptation Action #6? Please indicate your progress toward embedding equity in this action with "1" indicating no progress and "5" indicating significant progress. Below are several suggested ways that a local/tribal government can embed equity into this climate action provided as supportive guidance. This is not meant to be exhaustive of every possible action. Respondents can include actions not included in this list. Engage and collaborate with the community as part of the development of the Plan Ensure at least 50% of the solutions come directly from community members and/or organizations that represent community members from disinvested communities Capital projects benefit all community members equally. Low-income disinvested communities, or communities of color are prioritized (i.e. for green spaces, resilience hubs, parks etc.) Prioritize resilience capital projects by the potential to reduce risk to human life and critical infrastructure rather than based on income or tax value Display resilience capital projects on a map with underlying layers showing demographics such as race, income, etc. to visually show that investments are not only being made to benefit high-tax value and/or waterfront properties. This map should also speak to the amount of investment in different parts of the municipality, including disinvested areas Use an Equity Toolkit to identify and correct any unintended impacts (and potential benefits) of any capital project on low-income, disinvested communities, or communities of color. Ensure the toolkit for each project is made public for accountability and discussion Ensure capital projects also take into account unintended consequences such as gentrification and provide solutions to mitigate/diminish negative impacts posed by solutions Ensure the burden of public funding for capital projects is

equitable across communities Include a plan for upkeep and maintenance for any capital project
List the affirmative acts of community outreach

4

Q77. Please provide a brief explanation of the ways in which you are embedding equity into this adaptation action?

In 2022, the City of Miami Beach launched the Fight The Flood Private Property Adaptation (PPA) Program, a competitive grant for residential and commercial property owners in Miami Beach. Selected applicants may qualify to receive up to \$20,000 in funding to go towards a property risk assessment, in addition to the design and construction of resilient flood mitigation improvements. The grant is "match" based: the City will reimburse 50% of total program costs up to \$20,000. For low-to-moderate income (LMI) properties, 100% of program costs will be covered up to \$20,000. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/your-home/private-property-adaptation/>) The Jacobs Neighborhood Project Prioritization plan is prioritized by density and other categories, instead of just infrastructure need. The Project Evaluation Framework was publicly vetted and then applied to individual capital improvement projects. (<https://www.mbrisingabove.com/wp-content/uploads/Neighborhood-Project-Prioritization-1.pdf>)

Q78. Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #6. Max upload of five (5) files only.

Q78(a). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #6. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

Jacobs Report_Summary.pdf

Q78(b). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #6. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q78(c). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #6. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q78(d). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #6. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q78(e). Please provide any supporting documents under Adaptation Priority Action #6. Max upload of five (5) files only.:

(Did not answer)

Q79. Please indicate as to why you've been unable to make progress in Adaptation Action #6? Select all that apply.

Skipped due to logic

Q80. What resources could assist you in advancing this action?

Skipped due to logic